Cover

A pioneer in the art of opalescent stained glass, John La Farge designed this window, Sistine Madonna, for the house of Lina and Mamie Caldwell in Newport. Photograph by Julie L. Sloan.
CONTENTS

John La Farge's Windows for the Caldwell Sisters of Newport

JAMES L. YARNALL

Appendix:
John La Farge's Decorative Works in Rhode Island

Reconsidering Rhode Island History

JOANNE POPE MELISH
Know the truth and the truth shall make you free.
John La Farge’s Windows for the Caldwell Sisters of Newport

“Painting in air with a material carrying coloured light”—this is how the American artist John La Farge (1835-1910) defined the art of stained glass in 1902. Just over two decades earlier he had revolutionized the medium through the introduction of opalescent glass, a translucent, shimmering material long in use for utilitarian items such as bottles. Thanks to La Farge, the opalescent window, with its iridescent glow and endlessly varied textures, became a uniquely American emblem of Gilded Age wealth and cosmopolitan taste during the 1880s.

There are relatively few windows by La Farge in Rhode Island, despite the artist’s close biographical ties to the state. He came to Newport as an aspiring artist in 1859, married into Newport society a year later, and spent nearly two decades working at Newport as an easel painter and illustrator. Yet in spite of his Rhode Island connections, La Farge left his wife and children behind in 1879 for the plentiful opportunities in decorative work afforded by his native New York City. This virtual abandonment of Rhode Island, occurring just as he began his experimentation with opalescent stained glass, explains why so few of his windows today are found locally.

In the early 1890s La Farge undertook a unique commission for two Newport sisters who had been orphaned in early childhood. The resulting glass, comprising two suites of windows for a private chapel and a music room, exemplifies La Farge’s high-quality opalescent work of this era. Before the demolition of this Newport house in 1931, the windows were purchased by the bishop of Fall River for use in a convent. Now, after seven decades in Massachusetts, the glass has returned to Newport, where it will one day be put on display at Salve Regina University. Thus the time is appropriate to examine the patronage, history, technical features, and artistic quality of these windows.

The saga of the glass began with the fortune of William Shakespeare Caldwell, a peripatetic Kentucky gas baron who married Mary Eliza Breckenridge at Louisville in 1853. Just after the Civil War the couple moved to New York City with a newborn infant daughter, Mary Guendaline Byrd Caldwell (1865-1909). Simultaneously, they bought land for a Newport summer estate on the southeast corner of Kay and Ayrault Streets. In early 1867 Mary Eliza Breckenridge died in childbirth, but the child survived. In tribute to her mother, she was named Mary Eliza Breckenridge Caldwell (1867-1910).

With two small girls to bring up, William Shakespeare Caldwell found some strength in his devout Roman Catholicism. An early Kay Street resident related how the infant Caldwell sisters were "always dressed entirely in blue. It was explained to us that being long without children and having become converts to the Roman Catholic Church, the Caldwells prayed to the Virgin, and when in response to their petition two little daughters were given to them, these children were dedicated to the Mother of our Saviour." This story explains why both sisters were given the first name Mary.

James L. Yarnall is an associate professor in the Department of Art, Salve Regina University, Newport, and the editor of Newport History, the journal of the Newport Historical Society.

Portraits of Lina and Mamie Caldwell were sculpted in Greek marble for their joint tomb in Cave Hill Cemetery, Louisville, Kentucky, by Gilbert Bayes of London, 1910-12. Each figure is approximately 8 feet high. Photograph by Lois R. McCormick.
The death of William Shakespeare Caldwell in 1874 left the sisters orphaned. Mary Guendoline, nicknamed Mamie, and Mary Eliza, nicknamed Lina, jointly inherited in trust their father’s extensive fortune, including his Newport estate, and they lived out their teen years at New York City and Newport in the care of guardians.4

Mamie and Lina Caldwell later divided their fortunes between philanthropy and a lavish lifestyle. Beginning in 1884, the preferred recipient of their beneficence was Catholic University in Washington, D.C., then still in the planning stage. Mamie procured the title of school founder in 1888 by funding the first university building, Divinity Hall, still known popularly as Caldwell Hall. Even before this opened in 1889, Lina donated funds to the university for a chapel to be dedicated to the memory of her parents.7

Meanwhile, the sisters indulged in a long-planned overhaul of their Newport residence. The Newport Mercury announced the project in December 1890 as “a series of extensive alterations” carried out by the local architect John Dixon Johnston (1849-1928):

The plans call for a complete remodeling of the old house and enlarging it to about double its present dimensions, requiring an outlay of about fifty thousand dollars. Only two rooms in the whole house are to be allowed to remain as at present. The entrance hall will measure about 40 x 50 feet and be provided with lavatories, a large silver vault, etc. To the left of this hall will be the salon, music room, smoking room, and billiard room, and to the right, the library, morning room, and dining room. The lower floor of the building will further include a servants’ hall, large butler’s pantry, store rooms, kitchen, and back hall. A feature of the second story will be a large and richly fitted up chapel, with recessed altar, sacristy, ecclesiastical windows, etc.9

The work was completed by July 1891. The added chapel and music room each contained a suite of glass by La Farge. The chapel, located on the second floor, had the distinction of being the only known consecrated space of Catholic worship in a private Newport residence. It featured imported Bavarian oak choir stalls setting off a semicircular apse with three Gothic openings enclosing La Farge’s stained glass. The windows effectively served as a medieval triptych positioned behind the altar.

The imagery of the triptych held personal meaning for the Caldwell sisters. The central lancet depicts their patron saint and namesake, the Virgin Mary. La Farge adapted this

Triptych, 1889-92. Leaded opalescent glass, glass jewels, fired glass paint; approximate overall size 7 x 10 feet. Formerly in the chapel of the Caldwell sisters’ house in Newport; shown here in 1994 as installed at the convent of St. Patrick’s Church in Fall River; now in the collection of Salve Regina University, Newport. Photograph by Julie L. Sloan.
figure from a famous Renaissance altarpiece by Raphael, _The Sistine Madonna_ (circa 1508, Gemäldegalerie, Dresden, Germany). In the original composition, Raphael flanked the Virgin with kneeling figures of Pope Sixtus II and St. Barbara to create a traditional _Sacra Conversazione_. For his glass version, La Farge not only changed the identity of these saints but also placed them in separate window openings.

The left lancet depicts St. Elizabeth of Hungary (1207-1231), an obscure early-thirteenth-century saint who was fourteen when she wed the landgrave of Thuringia. Devoted to feeding the poor against the wishes of her disapproving husband, Elizabeth hid bread under her cloak. One day the landgrave ordered her to open the cloak, but a miraculous transformation of the bread into flowers spared Elizabeth from his wrath. The choice of St. Elizabeth of Hungary as the subject of the window no doubt stemmed from the fact that Eliza was a family name shared by one of the sisters and their deceased mother. In addition, the theme of charity echoed the benefactions of Mamie and Lina Caldwell to the Catholic Church.

The right lancet depicts St. John the Evangelist, shown transcribing divine truth with a pen and tablet. This was the patron saint of John Lancaster Spalding (1840-1916), a priest originally from Kentucky who comanaged the Caldwell estate and served as a spiritual advisor, and even a surrogate father, to the sisters. As early as 1880 Spalding and Mamie began taking frequent trips together at home and abroad, purportedly to facilitate her donations to the Catholic Church. Later, as will be seen, this behavior became the topic of considerable controversy.
La Farge's windows of this kind were the culmination of years of experimentation with opalescent glasses. Traditionally, these were reserved for use in utilitarian items such as vases and bottles. His innovative use of these glasses to create pictorial windows around 1879 launched La Farge to fame and fortune. Translucent and shimmering, opalescent glasses imparted a glowing look that La Farge compared to ancient Near Eastern glass. For ornamental passages in windows, the glasses simulated marble, velvet, or jewels. For figures, layered (or plated) opalescent glasses created shading and subtle color effects unattainable in traditional stained glass. Used in combination with enamel painting, opalescent glasses allowed La Farge to attain his aesthetic goal of creating windows rivaling the pictorial effects of French academic art of the era.

The Caldwell windows exploit opalescent glasses in this precise way. Realistic figures emerge through voluminous draperies created with rippled, multicolored opalescent glasses. White or clear opalescent glasses serve as the ground for flesh painting, applied with photographic precision by La Farge's specially trained glass painter, Juliette Hanson (active 1881-1915). Renaissance-styled niches behind the figures incorporate opalescent glasses that mimic white-, red-, and green-veined marble. Delicate semiprecious jewels delineate the Gothic tracery of the arched openings. Other vibrant glasses evoke clouds, flowers, swags, and assorted decorative flourishes. Leaded together by expert artisans in a fashion that respects the organic design, these diverse glasses render images that appear as seamless as easel paintings, worthy of competition in contemporary Parisian salons. As La Farge put it so well, the resulting windows are veritable “painting in air with a material carrying coloured light.”

The remainder of the windows from the Caldwell sisters' house are ornamental. Two religious lancets, originally residing in a small sacristy adjacent to the chapel, portray crosses and Chi-Rho emblems. Dominating the composition of these glowing panels are deep red opalescent...
glasses that exude papal splendor. The first-floor music room windows, adopting then-faddish Pompeian motifs, are in a lighter, almost playful key. These originally occupied a bay with four tall lights, each surmounted by two transoms.\textsuperscript{11} The lights formed two pairs, one featuring three-tiered fountains topped by garlands and the other depicting niches flanked by torchères and garlands. The glass slabs and glass jewels imitate alabaster, colored marble, dressed stone, incrusted mosaic, and actual jewels, creating a sumptuous display of color and texture.

Given the extent of their fortunes, the Caldwell sisters predictably attracted aristocratic European suitors. Mamie was betrothed in 1889 to the grandson of the king of Naples, Prince Joachim Napoleon Murat (1834-1901), who was twice her age. She broke off this engagement in 1890 after the prince demanded half her fortune as a dowry. Six years later, when Mamie wed Marquis Jean des Monstiers Mérinville, it was the talk of Paris—but the marriage soon dissolved into an unhappy, childless union. In order to retain her title of marquise, Mamie averted divorce by paying the marquis a large annual stipend.\textsuperscript{12}

In June 1890 Lina married a German diplomat, Baron Moritz Curt von Zedtwitz (1851-1896), in the chapel she had recently donated to Catholic University. A close friend of William Shakespeare Caldwell before the Civil War, von Zedtwitz had been a guardian and estate trustee for the Caldwell sisters since 1874. In May 1896 Lina gave birth to their only child, Waldemar Conrad von Zedtwitz. Just a few months later, during a regatta racing accident, the baron was struck and killed by a broken mast.\textsuperscript{13}

Mamie’s failing health inspired a strange turn of events five years later. After suffering a paralytic attack in early 1901, she confessed to Lina the details of an illicit affair she had carried on since her teen years with John Lancaster Spalding, their former guardian who was now the bishop of Peoria, Illinois. Lina quietly left the Roman Catholic Church in outrage, but she spoke up during the summer of 1902 when she saw Spalding about to ascend to the bishopric of Chicago.\textsuperscript{14} Her revelations to church officials triggered a hushed investigation that seemed to validate Mamie’s story of an illicit intimate relationship with Spalding at an inappropriately young age.\textsuperscript{15} Spalding’s candidacy failed and his career was effectively ended, but this did not quell the controversy swirling around the Caldwell sisters. In 1904 Mamie generated international headlines by converting to Protestantism.\textsuperscript{16} More headlines accompanied Lina’s publication in 1906 of The Double Doctrine of the Church of Rome, a diatribe on sexual corruption in the priesthood.\textsuperscript{17}

The Caldwell sisters thus lived out their last few years waging public warfare against the Catholic Church. When they died—Mamie in 1909 and Lina a year later—their joint tomb at Cave Hill Cemetery in Louisville, Kentucky, wasassertively nonreligious. It took the form of an ancient Greek exedra enclosing larger-than-life-size portrait statues of the sisters in classical garb. They stand gently intertwined, with locked gazes, on a base inscribed with a defiant motto: “Know the truth and the truth shall make you free.”\textsuperscript{18}

The sole heir to both sisters, Lina’s son Waldemar, sold off the Newport estate in 1931. The wrecker’s ball arrived that September, just after Bishop James Edwin Cassidy (1869-1951), apostolic administrator and later bishop of the Roman Catholic Diocese of Fall River, purchased the windows and associated chapel furnishings for thirty-five thousand dollars.\textsuperscript{19} Their installation at the convent of St. Patrick’s Church on South Main Street, Fall River, in 1932 followed the “general architectural plan” of the Newport layout, according to a news item of the time, “except inasmuch as difference of dimensions and other considerations placed a tax on the resources.”\textsuperscript{20} The windows remained in this setting
until the fall of 2004, when plans to demolish the convent to make way for a parking lot resulted in the acquisition of the glass by Salve Regina University in Newport.

Back in Rhode Island, the windows will serve as worthy reminders of the extraordinary accomplishments in stained glass of an artist who left an indelible mark on the artistic culture of the Gilded Age. With their complex history of patronage, their arcane subject matter, their allusions to the great artistic traditions of the classical past, and their exquisite rendering in opalescent glasses with a distinctly modern look, these are windows to contemplate and relish for generations to come.
Notes

This article benefited from unfettered access to the manuscript and files of the late Henry A. La Farge (1902-1985), whose systematic catalogue of La Farge's work, assembled beginning in 1933, was consulted in private hands before its transfer in 2004 to the Beinicke Rare Book and Manuscript Library at Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut. For technical advice, I thank my colleague and frequent collaborator Julie L. Sloan, a stained-glass restoration specialist who has worked on the La Farge windows described in this article. William Vareika, a noted Newport art dealer, was instrumental in bringing the La Farge windows to Newport by spearheading the acquisition. He was assisted in funding by Bernard A. G. Taradash, Thomas A. Rodgers Jr., and David Wallace. Many others at both the Roman Catholic Diocese of Fall River and in the administrative offices of Salve Regina University toile over the acquisition of the windows, especially Sister Marypatricia Murphy (former treasurer of the Religious Sisters of Mercy of America) and Sister M. Therese Antone, president of Salve Regina University.


2. For a monographic study of La Farge's Newport period, see James L. Yarnall, John La Farge in Paradise: The Painter and His Muse (Newport: William Vareika Fine Arts, 1995). La Farge would die in November 1910 at Providence's Butler Hospital, where his wife had committed him as a mental patient several months earlier. The circumstances of his final illness and death are described in detail in Mary A. La Farge and James L. Yarnall, "Nurturing Art and Family: The Newport Life of Margaret Mason Perry La Farge," Newport History 67 (fall 1995): 100-102.

3. The compound names of the Caldwell sisters appear with spelling variations in different sources. Their precise life dates also have been variously reported. The names and dates used here follow the inscriptions on their joint tomb at Cave Hill Cemetery in Louisville, Kentucky.


6. "Local Affairs," Newport Journal, 18 Jun. 1874, p. 2. The Caldwell sisters were left in the care of three guardians appointed by their father: Mrs. Mary S. Andrews of New York, Mrs. Mary L. Donnelly, and Mrs. Margaret Kelly (in order of living preference). According to Newport city directories, Mrs. Andrews lived with the girls from 1874 to 1876, as did Mrs. Donnelly in 1882, 1883, 1885, and 1890. The "Misses Caldwell" were also listed at this address regularly from 1876 to 1891; from 1891 to 1893 the listing was for Miss Gwendolyn Caldwell. No listing for any of these individuals appears after 1894, but the house remained in the sisters' hands until their respective deaths.


11. The design is known from a drawing in the Cooper-Hewitt Museum of Design, Smithsonian Institution (acc. no. 1961-10-6). This is inscribed in the hand of La Farge's son and studio assistant from 1886 to 1898, Bancel La Farge, as a study for the glass in the music room of the Caldwell house in Newport. The drawing shows what appears to be a flat bay window, but the footprint of the house seen in Newport atlases appears to show a semicircular bay window. There are no known photographs of the windows in situ, and indeed no known photographs of the exterior of the house. A single image of the interior is a drawing by John Dixon Johnston showing his proposal for the main hall as renovated in 1890, reproduced by Jordy and Monkhouse, Buildings on Paper, 105. The removal of the windows in 1931 and their subsequent sale to the Diocese of Fall River led to the loss and apparent breaking up of some of the transoms. This left behind somewhat odd fragments that are difficult to situate today within the original scheme, but that remain with the more complete lancets now owned by Salve Regina University. There are, in all, seventeen glass lights from the Caldwell house, with the three figure lancets, the two Chi-Rho windows, and the four Pompeian music room lights being the most intact and significant.


15. Ibid., 384-87.

16. Ibid., 390.


Appendix:
John La Farge’s Decorative Works in Rhode Island

This summary listing of Rhode Island decorative commissions by John La Farge covers murals, stained glass, and works in other media. Well-documented Rhode Island competitions or commissions that La Farge lost are also included. This information condenses catalogue entries that I researched and composed beginning in 1982 for the Catalogue Raisonné of the Works of John La Farge, a nonprofit education organization formerly located in New Canaan, Connecticut. This systematic catalogue of the works of John La Farge in all media was begun in 1933 by the late Henry A. La Farge, a grandson of the artist. After his death in 1985, his widow, Mary A. La Farge (1917–2002), continued to oversee the maintenance of the catalogue. Starting in 1988, I carried out extensive field work involving manuscript repositories, contemporary accounts in newspapers and periodicals, church and civic records, and other archival and published sources.

In 2004 the heirs of Mary A. La Farge donated the working Catalogue Raisonné to the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library at Yale University, where it can be consulted in a preliminary and partial state. I have since directed my writing on La Farge’s glass into The Iridescent Universe of John La Farge: Stained Glass for Gilded Age America. Coauthored by a noted opalescent stained-glass restoration expert, Julie L. Sloan, and projected for publication in 2007, this book will discuss and illustrate one hundred of La Farge’s most important windows.

One of four floral transoms, begun 1878. Leaded pat-metal, antique glass; 18 x 23 inches. Formerly in the house of William Watts Sherman, Newport; present location unknown. Photograph from a private collection by the late Henry A. La Farge.

1876: WILLIAM WATTS SHERMAN HOUSE
Shepard Avenue, Newport (Henry Hobson Richardson, architect). In 1876 and 1877 La Farge worked on designs for two sets of windows proposed for this house’s living hall, but these were not carried out because of problems with the Boston firm of William J. McPherson, which was responsible for manufacturing the glass. The designs are now at the Preservation Society of Newport County. A large, controversial window from this hall, now in the Museum of Fine Arts in Boston, was long mistakenly ascribed to La Farge but has been reliably reattributed to the English glass artist Daniel Cottier (1838-1891). The sources used to resolve this controversial commission include the Superior Judicial Court docket books and record books in the Massachusetts State Archives, Boston. La Farge made four floral transoms for the same hall during later renovations, which started around 1878. These were stolen in 1983 while ownership of the house was in transition, and they are now lost. The building is now used as a student residence by Salve Regina University.
1876: Edward King Tomb
Island Cemetery, Newport. La Farge designed this mortuary monument with the theme of “Steps to the Cross” in 1876, a year after the death of one of Newport’s most important China trade millionaires, Edward King (1815-1875). In what was the first of several important collaborations with La Farge, the noted American sculptor Augustus Saint-Gaudens (1848-1907) carved the design in Échallon marble from the Jura province of France. The vandalizing of the cross in the 1980s led to repairs with concrete that are obvious today. An extensive correspondence on this commission between La Farge and Saint-Gaudens survives in the Augustus Saint-Gaudens Papers, Dartmouth College, Hanover, New Hampshire.

1876: Margaret Mason Perry
La Farge House
10 Sunnyside Place, Newport (architect unknown). La Farge inserted both murals and glass into the decoration of a Greek Revival house dating from the mid-1840s that his wife purchased in 1873 and that he lived in with his family until moving to New York on his own in 1879. Starting around 1876, he placed murals on selected walls. Around 1880 he returned to paint a ceiling mural that varied designs that he was producing at the time for the United Congregational Church in Newport. The house remains, but these murals have been painted over with conventional interior house paint or have otherwise been obscured and/or destroyed. La Farge also placed four ornamental windows (perhaps left over from an unrelated early commission) in the library; these were sold into private hands and then lost in the 1970s. In addition, La Farge retooled a large eighteenth-century bookcase for the house into a design that reflects his unique flair for decorative embellishment and practical functionality. This bookcase now houses a collection of La Farge artwork and memorabilia in the Trustees' Room adjacent to the entrance to the headquarters of the Preservation Society of Newport County at 424 Bellevue Avenue in Newport. La Farge family letters still in private hands, along with family tradition conveyed through the late Mary A. La Farge, are the sources of this information.

1878: Providence City Hall
(Samuel F. J. Thayer, architect). In 1878 La Farge bid $11,150 to provide murals for the new City Hall but lost the competition to the Boston firm of William J. McPherson. Ironically, this had been the same firm that had defaulted on the production of his earlier windows intended for William Watts Sherman. The main source for information on La Farge’s role in this competition is a letter from the artist to Russell Sturgis written on an unspecified date in 1879. This is in the La Farge Family Papers, Department of Manuscripts and Archives, Sterling Memorial Library, Yale University (available on microfilm of the papers, reel 2, frames 993-995).

1879: United Congregational Church
(now Newport Congregational Church), Spring and Pelham Streets, Newport (Joseph Collins Wells, architect). La Farge received a $3,500 commission in late 1879 to provide a coordinated mural and glass scheme for this church. The murals, meant to emulate inlaid marbles from an early Christian basilica, were completed in mid-1880. These have
since been greatly altered and require extensive restoration. The windows consist of nineteen pairs of ornamental windows with designs inspired by Islamic mosques: ten pairs are large gallery windows carried out and installed in 1880; nine pairs are smaller aisle windows under the balcony, some of which were not installed until late 1881. Many of the windows suffered damage in a freak hail storm in August 1894. The restoration at that time had mixed results. All the windows now need reassessment, with many requiring extensive restoration. Aside from contemporary newspaper accounts, the sources of information on this commission are housed in the archives of the United Congregational Church, Valley Road, Middletown.
1880: **Linden Gate**
(Henry Gurdon Marquand House), Rhode Island Avenue and Old Beach Road, Newport (Richard Morris Hunt, architect). La Farge decorated the house’s reception room ceiling in a style that was a hybrid fusion of Japanese, Moorish, and Italian Renaissance elements. Completed in 1880, this room was destroyed in the burning of the house in 1973. The main source of information on the ceiling project is “Decorative Art News,” *Art Interchange* 5 (1 Sept. 1880): 4. Henry Gurdon Marquand (1819-1902), the patron of the house and the second president of the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York, also purchased an important La Farge window depicting *Peonies Blown in the Wind* in 1881 and installed it in his bedroom at Linden Gate. Removed after Marquand’s death in 1902 and sold at his estate sale, this window is now in the Metropolitan Museum of Art.

1880: **Château-Nooga**
(Christopher Columbus Baldwin House), Bellevue Avenue at Narragansett Avenue, Newport (George Browne Post, architect). La Farge received a commission worth $233.05 in 1880, presumably to provide transoms and a skylight over the house’s staircase. Some of the transoms, known only from early photographs of the exterior, now appear to be lost. Others still in place seem to be some of La Farge’s earliest glass in a style that owes technical features to conventional English painted glass.

Reception room ceiling, 1880. *Linden Gate*, Newport.

Right
Photograph by the author.
glass rather than to the opalescent style that he soon developed. Payments to La Farge for this glass are recorded in the George Browne Post Papers, New-York Historical Society, Job Records Ledger, 1:158.

1880: Channing Memorial Church 135 Pelham Street, Newport (Elbridge Boyden & Son, architects). La Farge received two glass commissions by 1880, at the time when funds for the major decorations of the proposed church were being pledged. His smaller memorial (reported cost, $1,000), honoring the Reverend Barnabas Bates (1785-1853), was installed near the east transept in early October 1881 and dedicated on 19 October of that year. Depicting St. Barnabas and the Virgin Mary, this was La Farge's first ecclesiastical window in his new opalescent style, and it received extensive publicity in the Newport, Boston, New York, and Providence press. La Farge's larger memorial (reported cost, around $7,000) dominates the church's north entrance façade and commemorates Boston banker Richard A. Baker Jr. (1819-1875) and his daughter Alice Starr Baker (1859-1880). Because of the window's prominence, the congregation was so intent on having it in place for the formal dedication of the church that the event was delayed at the last minute from September to October 1881. The postponement proved futile, and the window was not installed until 7 September 1882. Its formal dedication took place on 8 July 1883. The Baker memorial was one of the largest windows of La Farge's early career, as well as one of the most ambitious in terms of its pictorial complexity. Its subject is an evocative rendering of Psalm XXIII within a monumental Renaissance triptych that includes donor figures and a predella panel of Pre-Raphaelite maidens holding tablets. There was extensive newspaper coverage of both projects, and there are archival records relating to the commissions in the Channing Memorial Church Archives, housed in the church rectory on Pelham Street.

St. Barnabas and the Virgin, 1880-81. Leaded and painted opalescent glass, molded glass, confetti glass, glass jewels; overall size, 90 x 60 inches. Rev. Barnabas Bates Memorial Window, Channing Memorial Church, Newport. Photograph by the author.
Christ Leading the Soul through the Valley of the Shadow of Death, 1880-82. Leaded opalescent glass, molded glass, glass jewels, fired glass paint; approximately 264 x 144 inches. Richard Baker Jr. and Alice Starr Baker Memorial Window, Channing Memorial Church, Newport. Photograph by the author.

The Wise Virgin, 1881-82. Leaded opalescent glass, glass jewels; 86 x 44 1/2 inches. Mary Mackie Paine Memorial Window, Cathedral Church of St. John, Providence. Photograph by Julie L. Sloan.

1881: St. John's Episcopal Cathedral
271 North Main Street, Providence (architect unknown). La Farge received a commission in late 1881 for a memorial to Mary Mackie Paine (1841-1881), the deceased daughter of a church minister. The vestry noted acceptance of the completed window in April 1882. The window, with the biblical subject of The Wise Virgin, is rendered in rare handmade opalescent glasses. It remains in its original opening at the rear of the former Annunciation Chapel, but in 1967 it was enclosed within a balcony stairwell when the chapel was remodeled into the Nathan Bourne Crocker Memorial Library.
The vestry minutes of the church documenting this commission now reside in the Special Collections of the University Library at the University of Rhode Island.

1882: William Ives Goddard House (Brown University’s Maddock Alumni Center), George and Brown Streets, Providence (Stone and Carpenter, renovation architects). When this earlier Federal house underwent expansion and updating between 1882 and 1884, La Farge produced an impressive suite of staircase-landing windows depicting a classical landscape scene reminiscent of the frescos of Baldassare Peruzzi (1481-ca. 1536) in the Villa Farnesina at Rome. This is the only early major set of staircase lights by La Farge still found in its original context. La Farge also provided modest Pompeian-style door lights for the house’s main entrance. No early documentation for this commission has been located, but La Farge provided a photograph of the central part of the window to his first biographer, Cecelia Waern, who published it in “John La Farge, Artist and Writer,” Portfolio 26 (April 1896): 66.

1882: Robert Hale Ives Goddard House
Hope Street, Providence (William A. Potter, architect). Little is known of dining room murals and glass installed by La Farge around 1883 in a house that once stood on the southwest corner of George and Hope Streets. The house was razed around 1916, and no visual record of La Farge’s decorations has been found. A description of the commission appeared in “Architects and Decorators: The Goddard House,” Art Age 3 (March 1886): 46-47.

1883: Christ Church
1643 Lonsdale Avenue, Lincoln (Ware and Van Brunt, architects). For the chancel of a new Episcopal church funded by the Lonsdale Company (the manufacturing arm of Rhode Island’s Goddard-Ives-Brown clan), La Farge provided three chancel windows representing, respectively, a soldier in armor, a Madonna with Child, and an elderly Venetian merchant. These jointly served as memorials to the founding stockholders of the Lonsdale Company, including members of the same family responsible for the Goddard house commissions. According the company’s records, La Farge received
payments totaling $3,030 between February and July 1884, along with a fee of $77 for preparing designs on 11 December 1883. These records (day books, journals, stockholder meeting minutes, and ledgers) are housed at the Rhode Island Historical Society. The windows were formally dedicated, along with church, on 12 July 1884. A detailed account of the consecration, with a description of the windows, appeared in the Providence Journal the next day.

Arabesque window with floral center, circa 1883. Study for glass for the house of Ellen Francis Mason and Ida Means Mason, Newport. Watercolor, graphite, and ink on heavy off-white paper on off-white cardboard; sheet 12 x 9 1/2 inches. Courtesy of private collection.

1883: Ellen Frances Mason and Ida Means Mason House
Rhode Island Avenue, Newport (Henry Hobson Richardson, renovation architect). In 1883 Richardson expanded an earlier house built around 1852 by Seth C. Bradford for Robert Means Mason (1810-1879), a dry goods merchant from Boston. The patrons of the renovation were two of Mason’s unmarried daughters, who commissioned La Farge to produce decorative glass in 1883, as known from La Farge’s annotated color study. The glass was destroyed by fire, along with the house, in 1899. A replacement mansion designed by Irving Gill (1870-1936) shortly after the fire is used today as St. Michael’s Country Day School.

1883: Walter S. Langley House
21 Bull Street, Newport. A small glass transom depicting water lilies, a signature La Farge subject for watercolors and small oil paintings, was installed around 1883 in a house
that formerly stood on Bull Street near the corner of Mount Vernon. After the house was razed in 1936, the transom was donated to the Newport Historical Society by the wife of the original glass patron. The only documentation of this commission lies in the registration records of the Newport Historical Society.

1889: Caldwell Sisters House
Kay Street, Newport (John Dixon Johnston, renovation architect). As discussed above, La Farge installed chapel and music room windows in this house between 1890 and 1892. The house was razed beginning in the fall of 1931. After residing in the convent of St. Patrick’s Church in Fall River since 1932, the windows were purchased for Salve Regina University in 2004 and returned to Newport. The notes of the preceding article document this commission.

1893: The Breakers
(Cornelius Vanderbilt II House), Ochre Point Avenue, Newport (Richard Morris Hunt, architect). In 1892 Hunt collaborated on the expansion and renovation of the house of Cornelius Vanderbilt II (1843-1899) on the corner of Fifth Avenue at 1 West Fifty-Seventh Street in New York City. As part of this renovation he removed two stained-glass ceilings that had been installed by La Farge around 1882 and transferred them to Newport in 1895. The ceilings were mixed and matched, with a new unifying border added by Francis Augustus Lathrop (1849-1909), a former La Farge assistant. As installed over the grand staircase of The Breakers, the glass illuminates a large Flemish tapestry, one of Vanderbilt’s prize possessions. Documentation related to both the original 1882 skylights and their later retooling is in the George Browne Post Papers at the New-York Historical Society, as well as in the archives of the Preservation Society of Newport County. La Farge also proposed a substantial glass “pergola roof” for The Breakers in 1896, but this was never executed. In addition, lavish portieres made in La Farge’s atelier for the New York Vanderbilt house around 1882 were also transferred to Newport in 1895, and they now reside in the arcades of the Great Hall of The Breakers.

1904: Church of the Blessed Sacrament
239 Regent Avenue, Providence (Heins & La Farge, architects). In 1904, after as much as five years of planning, a project to decorate the interior of this new Roman Catholic Church finally entered the production stage. During the next year La Farge provided six chancel windows, which were funded by the subscriptions of various parishioners and church groups. Documentation of the commission is sparse in both archival
sources and the contemporary press, but photographs of models posed for the windows survive in a private collection that once belonged to Thomas Wright, the glass foreman for La Farge's windows. La Farge's son Christopher Grant La Farge (1862-1938), a New York architect of some note at the time, designed the mosaics and tiles throughout the church in conjunction with his firm of Heins & La Farge. La Farge's other son, Bancel (1865-1938), executed murals in the chancel around 1912, along with a rose window in 1917 based on designs by the church's pastor.

In addition to these decorative works, a window by La Farge formerly in a house at Canton, Massachusetts, is now in the Newport Art Museum. Color studies for La Farge decorations can be viewed in Rhode Island at the Newport Art Museum, the Museum of Art of the Rhode Island School of Design in Providence, the gallery of William Vareika Fine Arts in Newport, the archives of the Preservation Society of Newport County in Newport, and St. George's School in Middletown.

Decorative works formerly rumored to be by La Farge but now discounted after research are in the following locales: Chateau-sur-Mer, Bellevue Avenue, Newport; Church of the Ascension, Wakefield, South Kingstown; Grace Episcopal Church, Providence; Isaac Bell House, Bellevue Avenue, Newport; Kay Chapel, Church Street, Newport; Kingscote, Bellevue Avenue, Newport; Peace Dale Congregational Church, Peace Dale, South Kingstown; St. Columba's—The Berkeley Memorial, Middletown; St. John's Lodge, 50 School Street, Newport; St. Mark's Church, Jamestown; St. Michael's Church, Bristol; St. Peter's by the Sea Episcopal Church, Narragansett; and the Samuel Tilton House, Sunnyside Place, Newport. There are several other alleged La Farge windows in Rhode Island still under investigation.

Angel with Taper, 1904-5. Leaded opalescent glass, fired glass paint; approximately 6 x 3 feet. Sarah Sears Currin Memorial Window, Church of the Blessed Sacrament, Providence. Photograph by the author.
RHODE

EXPLORE HOW
RECENT SCHOLARSHIP
HAS CHALLENGED
COMMON
INTERPRETATIONS OF
RHODE ISLAND'S
PLACE IN HISTORY

John Nicholas Brown Center
for the Study of American Civilization
Brown University
Providence, Rhode Island
November 14-15, 1997
Reconsidering Rhode Island History

Joanne Pope Melish

In November 1997 the John Nicholas Brown Center at Brown University hosted a conference entitled “Rhode Island Reconsidered,” at which about forty scholars gathered to consider the question of “how recent scholarship has challenged common perceptions of Rhode Island’s place in regional and national history.” The “common perceptions” in question were associated in one way or another with what many historians have viewed as the problem of Rhode Island exceptionalism—Rhode Island as “Rogue Island” in several senses, from its role as a haven for religious dissenters in a region of established churches and its stubborn refusal to ratify the federal Constitution until 1790 to its reputation for quarreling with its neighbors and providing a breeding ground for corruption. According to this interpretation, analysis of events in Rhode Island history cannot illuminate historical problems beyond themselves because these experiences were utterly idiosyncratic; while a Rhode Island experience might serve as a comparative case, it can never be the central case study with broader applications. Although few of the twenty-three papers presented at the conference addressed the exceptionalist argument head on, many of them demonstrated that it just ain’t so. From illustrating methods for rediscovering the lives of the colonial poor and reconstructing the evolution of institutions that affected their lives to tracking the refinement of American culture, from exploring the connections between religious institutions and street politics to examining the professionalization of women, these papers offered convincing evidence of the relevance of Rhode Island history to larger problems of historical interpretation.

In the nine years since that conference, an astonishingly large body of scholarship focusing on Rhode Island history has been published or has appeared in Ph.D. dissertations that are likely to become future monographs. Much of this work indeed connects Rhode Island history with larger historical problems, sometimes by using Rhode Island as a case study, sometimes by placing events from Rhode Island’s past in conversation with events elsewhere in interesting ways. Other work does focus on some of the state’s best-known “firsts” and “onlies,” providing fresh, sometimes startling, interpretations. While some of this scholarship supports the notion that Rhode Island is indeed exceptional in some respects, it is an exceptionalism quite different from the old “Rogue Island” model.

In this essay I will survey a broad sampling of the literally hundreds of articles, monographs, and Ph.D. dissertations on aspects of Rhode Island history published in the last nine years. Although by no means exhaustive, my survey is intended to fairly reflect the remarkable diversity of topics, approaches, and arguments represented in this literature as a whole. I have included interdisciplinary work that borrows from literary, legal, anthropological, sociological, and/or material culture perspectives along with more traditional historical scholarship. Since my object here is to be as wide-ranging as possible and to alert readers to work published in places where they might not otherwise have encountered it, I have highlighted only a few of the more than two hundred articles published in the last nine years in Rhode Island History, Newport History, and Rhode
Island Jewish Historical Notes, local journals that are, of course, entirely devoted to Rhode Island history. I would encourage interested readers to consult lists of these articles, available as noted. Complete citations for works cited appear at the end of this essay.

Some of the most interesting work published recently challenges traditional understandings of Rhode Island’s colonial past and its founders. In “Roger Williams’s Key: Ethnography or Mythology?” (Rhode Island History, 1998), Jennifer Reid questions Williams’s A Key into the Language of America as an objective record of native culture, suggesting that its positive view was influenced by European preconceptions, as were other more negative accounts. Patricia E. Rubertone carries this analysis much further in Grave Undertakings: An Archaeology of Roger Williams and the Narragansett Indians (Smithsonian Institution Press, 2001). Rubertone shows how the picture of Indian culture presented in A Key was shaped by the colonial context of Williams’s encounters with the Narragansett; she reveals a much different interpretation, especially with respect to the role of women in native culture, that emerges from archaeological evidence gathered in the 1980s from the excavation of a colonial-era Narragansett burial site near West Kingston. Patrick Cesariini, too, revises the popular understanding of Williams’s relations with the Indians in “The Ambivalent Uses of Roger Williams’s A Key into the Language of America” (Early American Literature, 2003). Cesariini argues that Williams was actually ambivalent about converting Indians, but wrote A Key in part to establish his reputation in England as an authority on Indians and their conversion and thus to bolster his efforts to gain a royal charter for the colony.

The political ideas of Roger Williams receive comparative attention in Timothy L. Hall’s Separating Church and State: Roger Williams and Religious Liberty (University of Illinois Press, 1998). After recounting Williams’s life from his arrival in Massachusetts in 1631 to his death in 1683, Hall contrasts Williams’s ideas about freedom of religion with those of John Locke, Thomas Jefferson, James Madison, and one controversial modern figure—Justice Antonin Scalia. In “Roger Williams and His Place in History: The Background and the Last Quarter Century” (Rhode Island History, 2000), Anthony O.Carlino, too, argues that Williams’s ideas have relevance for twenty-first-century debates about the separation of church and state. James Calvin Davis addresses a different aspect of Williams’s concern for tolerance in “A Return to Civility: Roger Williams and Public Discourse in America” (Journal of Church and State, 2001). Davis suggests that Williams saw tolerance as essential not only for the protection of individual liberty, especially religious liberty, but for the civility of public discourse that would support the advancement of the common good.

Two other early Rhode Island religious figures have also received overdue attention. A contemporary of Williams who has languished in his shadow unjustly, in the opinion of the late Sydney V. James, was John Clarke, an early settler, physician, and leader of Newport’s Baptists. In John Clark and His Legacies: Religion and Law in Colonial Rhode Island, 1638-1750 (Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999), James attempts to correct
the record, arguing that Clarke’s long service to the Baptist community of Newport and his role in procuring the second royal charter in 1663, which remained in effect until 1842, make him at least as significant a Rhode Island founder as Williams. Sheryl A. Kujawa’s “The Path of Duty Plain: Samuel Hopkins, Sarah Osborn, and Revolutionary Newport” (Rhode Island History, 2000) examines the relationship between Sarah Osborn, a Newport schoolteacher, and Samuel Hopkins, a theologian, antislavery activist, and the pastor of the First Congregational Church in Newport from 1770 to 1803. Osborn and her friend Susannah Anthony provided religious education for Newport’s slaves; by helping them, Hopkins was able to gain a platform for his anti-slavery views through Osborn’s female society.

The role of religion in class formation and politics is the subject of four excellent works that explore this relationship in a Rhode Island context. In Piety in Providence: Class Dimensions of Religious Experience in Antebellum Rhode Island (Cornell University Press, 2000), Mark S. Schantz joins a growing body of scholars who have explored the connections between evangelical religion and the rise of the market economy. He shows how the religious revival of 1820 precipitated a gradual division between plebeian and bourgeois culture in the context of Providence’s industrializing economy, as laborers and artisans attracted to evangelical religion came to view the exploitation of workers as unchristian, while traditional, more decorous Calvinist churches remained the stronghold of elites who understood the pursuit of wealth as a godly activity. Later in the nineteenth century an influx of Catholic immigrants reshaped politics and culture in Rhode Island. In “Bringing Religion into Working-Class History: Parish, Public, and Politics in Providence, 1890–1930” (Social Science History, 2000), and in Ballots and Bibles: Ethnic Politics and the Catholic Church in Providence (Cornell University Press, 2004), Evelyn Savidge Sterne shows how Catholic churches served as sites for training in political activism for Providence’s Catholic immigrants. By participating in the organization of educational and social activities in local parish churches, and by sometimes resisting authority there, workers learned how to organize effectively in the political sphere and how to confront authority, and they then applied these lessons in labor activism and the struggle to overturn municipal voting restrictions. Issues of Catholicism and class conflict are the subject of Scott Molloy’s “No Philanthropy at the Point of Production: A Knight of St. Gregory against the Knights of Labor in the New England Rubber Industry, 1885” (Labor History, 2003). Molloy explores the class divisions between striking Irish Catholic workers affiliated with the Knights of Labor and their Irish Catholic employer at a rubber boot factory in Woonsocket in 1885.

Of a variety of scholarship on Rhode Island Jewish history that has appeared recently, two works deserve special attention. One is an anthology, The Jews of Rhode Island, published in 2004 by the Rhode Island Jewish Historical Association in association with Brandeis University Press and University Press of New England to celebrate the 50th anniversary of Rhode Island Jewish Historical Notes and the 350th anniversary of the American Jewish community. Edited by George M. Goodwin and Ellen Smith, the anthology includes seventeen previously published articles, two new introductory articles, and ninety-seven photographs covering Jewish history in Rhode Island from the formation of the first Jewish community in Newport in the 1740s through World War II. Another work highlighting the early history of the Rhode Island Jewish community is Holly Snyder’s 2000 Ph.D. dissertation from Brandeis University, “A Sense of Place: Jews, Identity, and Social Status in Colonial British America, 1654-1831.” Comparing the colonial experiences of Jews in Newport with those in Savannah, Georgia, and Kingston, Jamaica, Snyder uses the social status of Jews as a lens through which to explore such evolving social values as religious and racial toleration and the status of women, and to evaluate the impact of migration on cultural values.
The lives of Rhode Island women have inspired several pieces of compelling scholarship, especially but not exclusively focusing on the Revolutionary and antebellum periods. Sarah Leavitt explores what late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century advertisements for runaway wives can reveal about marriage and women's changing expectations of it in "She Hath Left My Bed and Board: Runaway Wives in Rhode Island, 1790-1810" (Rhode Island History, 2000). The role of women as important participants in the economy is examined comparatively in Ellen Louise Hartigan-O'Connor's 2003 Ph.D. dissertation from the University of Michigan, "The Measure of the Market: Women's Economic Lives in Charleston, South Carolina, and Newport, Rhode Island." Hartigan-O'Connor shows that the activities of free and enslaved women as workers, vendors, participants in lending and borrowing, and creators of an array of informal networks of exchange were crucial in shaping urban commercial culture in port cities north and south. In The Devotion of These Women: Rhode Island in the Antislavery Network (University of Massachusetts Press, 2002), Deborah Bingham VanBerkhoven shows that the work of women in grassroots organizing, sewing circles, bazaars, and petition drives was the key factor in sustaining the antislavery movement in antebellum Rhode Island. One of these antislavery activists was Elizabeth Buffum Chace, who later became a leading Rhode Island suffragist. In Elizabeth Buffum Chace and Lillie Chace Wyman: A Century of Abolitionist, Suffragist, and Workers' Rights Activism (McFarland, 2003), Elizabeth C. Stevens offers a biographical study of Chace and her daughter, who chronicled the activism of her mother's generation in fiction and biography. Melinda Talbot uses the business experiences of a Warwick manufacturer of hats as revealed in her daybook to explore the role of women artisans in antebellum Rhode Island in "Mary Anne Warriner, Rhode Island Milliner" (Dublin Seminar for New England Folklife, Annual Proceedings, 1999). In "Frances Whipple and the Wampanoag: A Nineteenth-Century New England Factory Magazine" (Rhode Island History, 2001), Sarah C. O'Dowd uses Whipple's tenure as editor of the Wampanoag, published at Fall River, Massachusetts, to examine how class divisions created difficulties for female intellectuals who sought to advocate on behalf of female mill workers.

Women in the teaching profession in Rhode Island are the subject of two articles, both published in the History of Education Quarterly. "The Paradox of Bureaucratization: New Views on Progressive Era Teachers and the Development of a Woman's Profession" (1999), by Victoria-Maria MacDonald, shows how the increasing power of the superintendent of schools to choose teachers in Providence between 1880 and 1900 actually had a liberating effect on female teachers, freeing them from the arbitrary politics of appointment by elected school committees. The struggle of married female teachers for the right to obtain tenure in Pawtucket, which by 1965 was the only Rhode Island school system that still refused to tenure married women, is the subject of David M. Donahue's "Rhode Island's Last Holdout: Tenure and Married Women Teachers at the Brink of the Women's Movement" (2002).

Women are also the focus in scholarly examinations of two sensational crimes involving Rhode Islanders. In Killed Strangely: The Death of Rebecca Cornell (Cornell University Press, 2002), Elaine Forman Crane examines the 1673 murder of Rebecca Cornell of Portsmouth, who burned to death in her fireplace while her family ate dinner in the next room, and whose son was eventually hanged for her murder. Two articles explore contemporary accounts of the trial of Ephraim K. Avery, a Methodist minister from Bristol, Rhode Island, for the murder of another woman named Cornell a century and a half later—Sarah Maria Cornell, a pregnant single mill worker found hanging from the pole of a haystack in Fall River. In "The Terrible Haystack Murder: The Moral Paradox of Hypocrisy, Prudery, and Piety in Antebellum America" (American Journal of Legal History, 1997), Ian C. Pilarczyk analyzes newspaper coverage of the trial of Avery to examine Victorian sexual mores. In "Indelicate Exposure: Sentiment and Law in Fall River: An Authentic Narrative"
(American Literature, 2002), Jeanne Elders DeWard discusses the 1833 novel about the case written by Rhode Island author Catharine Williams, who attempted to rehabilitate the reputation of Cornell, widely seen as an example of the damage done to the moral character of women by their employment as industrial laborers.

A lively area of scholarship on early American history in the last decade has been the experiences of native peoples and Africans, along with the institutions, practices, and events that shaped their relations with whites in the colonial context. The conflicts between native peoples and European settlers, leading to devastating wars between them in seventeenth-century New England, are the focus of “Worlds Apart: Puritan Perceptions of the Native American during the Pequot War” (Rhode Island History, 1998), by Timothy L. Wood, and “The Long Shadow of King Philip” (American History, 2004), by Glenn W. LaFantasie. “The Right to a Name: The Narragansett People and Rhode Island Officials in the Revolutionary Era” (Ethnohistory, 1997), a pathbreaking collaboration between historian Ruth Wallis Herndon and Narragansett tribal historian Ella Wilcox Sekatau, examines the conflicts between the Narragansett people and Rhode Island leaders in the second half of the eighteenth century. Herndon and Sekatau show how town leaders attempted to manage the lives of native people and orchestrate their extinction as a tribe by redesignating them as “Negro” or “Black,” while native people struggled to maintain their tribal identity and independence. In “Shifting Boundaries of Race and Ethnicity: Indian-Black Intermarriage in Southern New England, 1760-1880 (Journal of American History, 1998), Daniel Mandell argues that it was the considerable extent of intermarriage between blacks and Indians in the context of shared economic and social conditions that led blacks and whites to characterize mixed-race people as “black.”

Rhode Island’s role as the center of the American slave trade has received increasing attention in the last few years. “The Rhode Island Slave-Traders: Butchers, Bakers, and Candlestick-Makers” (Slavery & Abolition, 2002), by Rachel Chernos Lin, breaks new ground in showing that the slave trade was not the exclusive province of a small, wealthy elite, as previously thought, but rather involved an economically and socially diverse group that included artisans and small producers. A profile of a single slaving voyage to Upper Guinea in 1793 during which the crew suppressed a slave revolt, and an analysis of the public response to the event, are the subjects of Mitra Sharafi’s “The Slave Ship Manuscripts of Captain Joseph B. Cook: A Narrative Reconstruction of the Brig Nancy’s Voyage of 1793” (Slavery & Abolition, 2003). In “Rhode Island and the Slave Trade” (Rhode Island History, 2002), J. Stanley Lemons provides an overview of the trade and the struggle between its supporters and opponents between the 1640s and 1790s. In contrast to some other scholars, Lemons sees the trade as a relatively insignificant part of Rhode Island’s maritime commerce.

Rhode Island also had the largest percentage of slaves of any New England colony, and abolition was fiercely contested here. Both Robert K. Fitts, in Inventing New England’s Slave Paradise: Master/Slave Relations in Eighteenth-Century Narragansett, Rhode Island (Garland Publishing, 1998), and James C. Garman, in “Rethinking ‘Resistant Accommodation’: Toward an Archaeology of African-American Lives in Southern New England, 1638-1800” (International Journal of Historical Archaeology 1998), examine the nature of relations between slaves and masters. Fitts argues that slave owners employed close surveillance, threats, and physical punishment to coerce their slaves, who resisted, sometimes violently, and frequently ran away, disproving the contention that New England slavery was benign and paternalistic. Garman analyzes the economy and demographics of southern Rhode Island agricultural production to argue that slave-master relations in the Narragansett Country may have occupied a middle ground between accommodation and resistance.
The development of the movement to end slavery in Rhode Island is the subject of John Wood Sweet’s “More Than Tears: The Ordeal of Abolition in Revolutionary New England” (Explorations in Early American Culture, 2001). Sweet focuses on two stories, one concerning the well-known conflict between John and Moses Brown over John’s persistent involvement in the slave trade and the other involving a struggle between the Gardner family and their slave Mary Wamsley. The John-Moses conflict also receives book-length treatment in Charles Rapleye’s Sons of Providence: The Brown Brothers, the Slave Trade, and the American Revolution (Simon & Schuster, 2006).

Bondage and colonialism had a lasting impact on how African Americans and native people preserved and understood their own identities on the one hand and on the development of white racism on the other. Self-making in the context of slavery and freedom by one famous African-born slave who lived in Connecticut and Rhode Island is examined by Robert E. Desrochers Jr. in “Not Fade Away: The Narrative of Venture Smith, an African American in the Early Republic” (Journal of American History, 1997). The relations between free people of color and New England Quakers in the early nineteenth century is the subject of “Paul and Stephen, Unlikely Friends” (Quaker History, 2001), by the late Rosalind C. Wiggins. Her lens is the friendship that developed between Paul Cuffe, an Afro-Indian sea captain from Westport, Massachusetts, and Stephen Gould, a Newport Quaker, in the course of their antislavery efforts, as portrayed in Cuffe’s writings. John Wood Sweet’s Bodies Politic: Negotiating Race in the American North, 1730-1830 (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003) investigates the experiences of people of color as they made places for themselves in New England society in slavery and freedom, while my own Disowning Slavery: Gradual Emancipation and “Race” in New England, 1780-1860 (Cornell University Press, 1998) focuses on the development of racial thinking in the context of the slow demise of slavery. Both of these books make extensive use of Rhode Island sources. In her 1998 University of Michigan Ph.D. dissertation, “Defining and Creating African-American Identity: An Archaeological Study of Ethnicity at Casey Farm, Saunderstown, Rhode Island, 1790-1820,” Ann-Eliza H. Lewis shows how archaeology and landscape analysis can be used to reconstruct early African American identity.


Rhode Island’s historically diverse population also makes social class an important topic in Rhode Island history. Ruth Wallis Herndon continues her careful analysis of the “management” of the poor by town governments in eighteenth-century Rhode Island with two works. The first, coauthored by John E. Murray, is an article on the indenture of poor children, “Markets for Children in Early America: A Political Economy of Pauper Apprenticeship” (Journal of Economic History, 2002), that explains the uses of child indenture in Rhode
Island not only as poor relief but also as a system of education and craft training. The second, *Unwelcome Americans: Living on the Margin in Early New England* (University of Pennsylvania Press, 2001), examines the system of warning out people “likely to become chargeable” who could not claim legal settlement in the town in which they were living and were therefore considered undesirable. Her book presents forty brief biographies compiled from over 750 transient examinations and a wide variety of supplementary sources. The need for poor relief in Rhode Island persisted after the warning-out system ended, and Andrew Morris takes up the issue after the Civil War in “The Problem of Poverty: Public Relief and Reform in Postbellum Providence” (*Rhode Island History*, 1998). He describes how Rhode Island developed a carrot-and-stick approach to public welfare, creating a network of public and private programs to help the “deserving” poor while passing laws establishing strict residency and work requirements unique in New England. One particular institution created to sort out the deserving from the undeserving poor was the town farm or poor farm; James C. Garman and Paul A. Russo explore how the Smithfield Town Farm and Asylum influenced social values of neighboring elites in “A Disregard of Every Sentiment of Humanity: The Town Farm and Class Realignment in Nineteenth-Century Rural New England” (*Historical Archaeology*, 1999). The upper class is the object of study in “Polish: The Maintenance of Manners” (Dublin Seminar for New England Folklife, *Annual Proceedings*, 2001), by J. Coral Woodbury, which examines the social rules by which elite women in Newport organized their large household staffs at the turn of the twentieth century.

Turning from social and cultural history to political history, several works focus on the development of early political and legal institutions and leadership in Rhode Island. Mary Sarah Bilder’s *The Transatlantic Constitution: Colonial Legal Culture and the Empire* (Harvard University Press, 2004) examines constitutional development in Rhode Island as a case study of how British officials were able to temper their desire to establish a uniform rule of law across the empire by their awareness of the necessity to accommodate the unique circumstances of individual colonies. The late Sydney V. James examines the evolving structure of governing institutions in colonial Rhode Island in *The Colonial Metamorphoses in Rhode Island: A Study of Institutions in Change* (University Press of New England, 2000). He shows how predominant concern for local interests and individual freedom gradually gave way to a shared commitment to a central government. The Revolutionary-era battle for political control of the colony between Newport’s established elites and Providence’s entrepreneurial class, as seen from the perspective of a leader of the Newport faction, is the subject of James F. Guy’s 2003 Kent State University Ph.D. dissertation, “The Public Life of a Private Man: Samuel Ward, 1725-1776.” Another Ph.D. dissertation, this one from Brown University in 2002, uses Rhode Island as a case study to examine the early court system in “The Lower Federal Courts in the Early Republic: Rhode Island, 1790-1812,” by Donald Kurt Graham. In “Popular Sovereignty or Public Anarchy? America Debates the Dorr Rebellion” (*Rhode Island History*, 2002), Patrick T. Conley discusses the national debate over the uses of insurrection to support popular government that erupted as a consequence of Rhode Island’s Dorr Rebellion in 1841-42. Politics in the twenti-
eth century is the subject of Stefano Luconi's *The Italian American Vote in Providence, Rhode Island, 1916-1948* (Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2004). Luconi examines the shifting party allegiance of Italian Americans, who began voting Democratic in Providence in 1916 when the party began offering them a limited degree of patronage and access to elective office, while Italian Americans elsewhere were not attracted to the party until the 1928 candidacy of Al Smith.

Rhode Island's military experience in war and in peace has been a very popular subject. Works focusing on Rhode Island's role in the American Revolution include "Rhode Island's Controversial General: Nathanael Greene and the Continental Congress, 1776-1780" (*Rhode Island History*, 2001), by William P. Leeman; "The Battle of Rhode Island, 29 August 1778: A Victory for the Patriots" (*Rhode Island History*, 2004), by Patrick T. Conley; "Rochambeau: Two Hundred Years Later" (*Newport History*, 2003-4), by George C. Woodbridge; and *Newport, the French Navy, and American Independence* (Redwood Library, 2005), by John B. Hattendorf. Two particularly interesting articles on the Civil War experiences of Rhode Islanders are Sara Bartlett's "Kady Brownell, A Rhode Island Legend" (*Minerva: Quarterly Report on Women and the Military*, 2001), a portrait of an extraordinary woman who accompanied her husband to war in the First Rhode Island Volunteer Infantry and became famous for performing an act of bravery on the battlefield, and Cynthia Comery Ferguson's "The Providence Marine Corps of Artillery in the Civil War" (*Rhode Island History*, 2002), which describes the wartime experience of the first volunteer artillery battery to leave for the war. An oral history project that uncovered many stories of women's military service is the source of "So Proudly They Served: Rhode Island Waves in World War II" (*Rhode Island History*, 2003), by Evelyn M. Cherpak, which describes the history of Rhode Island women's service with the United States Navy in the 1940s. Finally, Paul R. Schratz surveys the development of Newport's Naval War College in "The Hundred Year Growing Pain: Opposition and Opportunity" (*Naval War College Review*, 1998).

Ever since Samuel Slater's introduction of water-powered spinning in Pawtucket in the 1790s, technological innovation in the state has been an important part of Rhode Island history and scholarly study. In "The Limits of 'Homo Economicus': An Appraisal of Early American Entrepreneurship" (*Journal of the Early Republic*, 2004), Barbara M. Tucker and Kenneth H. Tucker Jr. use the examples of textile industry innovators Samuel Slater and Amos Lawrence to show how studies of early entrepreneurial activity can illuminate broader questions about society and culture. Linda Welters and Margaret T. Ordonez examine a scrap quilt made in Rhode Island to trace two decades of calico printing in "Early Calico Printing in Rhode Island" (*Uncoverings* 2001). "The Hibbert-Townsend Latch Needle Mystery Unraveled: Patent Control and Nineteenth-Century American Knitting Machines" (*Dublin Seminar for New England Folklife, Annual Proceedings*, 1999), by Richard M. Candee, describes the controversy surrounding the invention and development of latch needles, independently patented by both James Hibbert of Providence and English hosier Matthew Townsend. In "Frank and Lillian Gilbreth Bring Order to Providence: The Introduction of Scientific Management at the New England Butt Company, 1912-13" (*Rhode Island History*, 1997), Jane Lancaster describes how the Gilbreths departed from the principles of Taylorism in their work at a Providence manufacturer of braiding machines and butts by introducing motion studies and industrial psychology into scientific management. Another important Rhode Island industry is the manufacture of fine and costume jewelry, and Philip Scanton's "The Horrors of Competition: Innovation and Paradox in Rhode Island's Jewelry Industry, 1860-1914" (*Rhode Island History*, 1997) describes the lack of cooperation and other factors that made the jewelry business subject to cycles of depression and recovery through the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Rapid industrialization and urbanization altered the Rhode Island landscape in many ways. In "Railroad Development in Rhode Island during the Nineteenth Century" (*Rhode
Island History, 2003), Stewart P. Schneider follows the first sixty years of railroad building that produced almost five hundred miles of track in the tiny state by 1900. Richard A. Wilson Jr. discusses the hasty construction of the Blackstone Canal between 1825 and 1828 and its largely unsuccessful operation due to problems with its fluctuating water level and other technical difficulties in “The Blackstone Canal” (Historical Journal of Massachusetts, 2000). In “A Mechanic in the Garden: Landscape Design in Industrial Rhode Island” (IA: The Journal of the Society for Industrial Archaeology, 1998), Richard Greenwood explores the ideas of manufacturer Zachariah Allen for environmental engineering, community planning, and creation of public parks, ideas that took shape in Allen’s mill villages and in Providence’s Promenade complex, built by Brown & Sharpe along the Woonasquatucket River. In spite of the progressive ideas of some industrialists like Allen, however, industrialization wreaked havoc with the natural environment. In “Rejuvenating Waters” (Preservation, 2001), Rich Lang describes the efforts to revitalize Providence in the 1990s by cleaning up its rivers and adapting the historic buildings near its waterways to new commercial and residential uses.

If Rhode Island’s rivers sparked an industrial revolution, the beauty of its beaches made the Ocean State a vacation destination from the beginning of the nineteenth century. Jon Sternias looks comparatively at the rise of Newport and two other American resorts in First Resorts: Pursuing Pleasure at Saratoga Springs, Newport, and Coney Island (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001), showing how a relaxed, mixed-class public experience at these resorts before the Civil War gave way to increasing commercialization of services and withdrawal of the rich into private summer “cottages” after the war. Mary R. Miner describes how Jamestown became a popular summer residence and vacation spot for the wealthy from the 1840s to the turn of the century in “Some Jamestown Summer People” (Newport History, 1998). In “The Casino Theatre at Newport, Rhode Island: The Summer Colonists’s Playhouse: Reality, Grandeur, Memories, 1881-1960,” a 2001 Ph.D. dissertation from Tufts University, Marialyn Elizabeth Riley chronicles the life of the famous theater inside the Newport Casino from its founding in 1881 by James Gordon Bennett, the flamboyant owner of the New York Herald, through its metamorphosis into a site for legitimate summer-stock productions beginning in 1927 until its closing in 1960. Myra B. Young Armstead’s “Lord, Please Don’t Take Me in August”: African Americans in Newport and Saratoga Springs, 1870-1930 (University of Illinois Press, 1999) looks at life in two resort communities from the perspective of blacks who moved there. Armstead describes the symbiotic relationship that evolved between permanent black residents and mostly white summer vacationers whose annual arrival created jobs, and she shows how people of color established kin networks, created their own class structure and institutions, and took an active role in shaping the urban culture of the communities they entered. The recent revitalization of Providence has made the capital city, if not a resort, something of a magnet for conventions, performing arts, and music, a development examined in Providence, the Renaissance City (Northeastern University Press, 2004), by Francis J. Leazes Jr. and Mark T. Motte.

Other kinds of Rhode Island history have been made and documented in some unlikely places. Two recent studies use Rhode Island quilts as starting points in fascinating explorations of the cultural moments in which they were produced. In “The
‘Vampire’ Quilt: A Material Culture Study” (Uncoverings, 1999), Cynthia Dimock-Quaglia explores superstition in the late nineteenth century through examination of a bear-paw quilt made in Exeter by Mercy Lena Brown, an alleged vampire whose entire family died of tuberculosis. “The Cultural Significance of the Block Island Woman’s Christian Temperance Union Quilt of 1931” (Uncoverings, 2003), by Sarah Rose Dangelas, uses the quilt to explore the efforts of Block Island women to support temperance in the face of the threatened repeal of Prohibition. Moving from material to performance culture, Bradford Scott Simon’s “Entering the Pit: Slam-Dancing and Modernity” (Journal of Popular Culture, 1997) utilizes fieldwork at Club Babyhead in Providence to analyze the emergence of slam-dancing in the early 1990s as a form of social commentary by a music-based youth culture.

Finally, two interesting recent works of historical fiction, locally published, are based on events in early Rhode Island history. The creation of the First Rhode Island Regiment is the subject of The Black Regiment of the American Revolution (Moon Mountain Publishing, 2004), a children’s book written by Linda Crotta Brennan and illustrated by Cheryl Kirk Noll. Craig Anthony’s King’s Province: Samuel Tefft’s Narrative of the Narragansett Country (Finca Publishing, 2005) uses primary documents from the period to construct an imaginative first-person account exploring the circumstances surrounding the 1676 hanging and quartering of Joshua Tefft for treason for fighting with the Narragansett against the English.

I have surveyed a broad range of literature here, yet it probably represents no more than a third to a half of the scholarship and fiction on Rhode Island history written from 1997 to the present. While a few of the scholars whose work is discussed in this essay continue to focus on Rhode Island as the exceptional case—dissent is dissent, after all—a great many more have used the rich array of documentary and material evidence that has been carefully preserved in Rhode Island archives and libraries to make scholarly arguments on issues of political, social, and cultural significance far beyond Rhode Island’s borders. It’s an impressive body of work.

Notes

1. Press release, Brown University News Bureau, 15 Oct. 1997. This release, which includes a complete conference program listing all papers and participants, is still available online at http://www.brown.edu/Administration/News_Bureau/1997-98/97-036.html.

2. Ph.D. dissertations can be obtained through interlibrary loan and may be purchased from UMI’s Dissertation Hotline at 1 800 521-3042.

3. A complete list of articles published in Rhode Island History, as well as a PDF version of the list, is available online at http://www.rihs.org/publications.html. The complete list of articles published in Newport History is available at http://newporthistorical.org/journals.htm or by writing to the Newport Historical Society. The articles list for Rhode Island Jewish Historical Notes is available from Anne Sherman at rjhist@aol.com or by writing to her at the Rhode Island Jewish Historical Association, 130 Sessions Street, Providence, R.I. 02906.
Works Cited

Articles


Reid, Jennifer. "Roger Williams’s Key: Ethnography or Mythology?" *Rhode Island History* 56, 3 (1998): 76-86.


Works Cited continued


Books


Ph.D. Dissertations


